Fear of crime is a widespread urban phenomenon that social scientists around the world have studied for decades. With roots in Georg Simmel’s essay on “Metropolis and Mental Life,” the Chicago School’s social disorganization theory and later, defensible space and broken windows theory, generations of researchers have assessed the local urban conditions that contribute to residents’ fears of their strangers in their neighborhoods. Disorder, insecurity, and fear also promote withdrawal from community participation, reducing eyes on the street, collective efficacy, and satisfaction with one’s neighborhood. Aside from physical and environmental conditions, social diversity is often perceived as a threatening form of disorder. This paper tests whether various aspects of neighborhood social diversity -- ethnic, racial, national, religious, and class -- influence individual residents’ insecurity (not feeling safe to walk alone in one's own neighborhood), controlling for both their own personal vulnerabilities and for other types of neighborhood disorder and the actual crime rate. Based upon a multi-level analysis in the diverse city of Tel Aviv-Jaffa, we find that, other things being equal, living in an area with a higher percentage of poor people, non-Jews (Arabs, Christians, Eritrean refugees), Russians (post-1990 immigrants), Mizrachim (Middle Eastern Jews), or Ashkenazim (European Jews) does not produce significantly greater insecurity. However, perceived neighborhood disorder and Jewish religiosity among those living in non-religious neighborhoods do contribute to insecurity. Social disorder thus appears to have context-dependent effects on fear of crime. The conclusions reflect upon potential differences between the context of this study and cities in other national settings.